

EXHIBIT 4

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
SAN JOSE DIVISION

APPLE INC., A CALIFORNIA CORPORATION,)	C-11-01846 LHK
)	
)	SAN JOSE, CALIFORNIA
PLAINTIFF,)	
)	AUGUST 13, 2012
VS.)	
)	VOLUME 7
SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO., LTD., A KOREAN BUSINESS ENTITY; SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS AMERICA, INC., A NEW YORK CORPORATION; SAMSUNG TELECOMMUNICATIONS AMERICA, LLC, A DELAWARE LIMITED LIABILITY COMPANY,)	PAGES 1989-2320
)	
)	
)	
)	
)	
)	
DEFENDANTS.)	

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS
BEFORE THE HONORABLE LUCY H. KOH
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

APPEARANCES ON NEXT PAGE

OFFICIAL COURT REPORTER: LEE-ANNE SHORTRIDGE, CSR, CRR
CERTIFICATE NUMBER 9595

1 A P P E A R A N C E S :

2 FOR PLAINTIFF MORRISON & FOERSTER
3 APPLE: BY: HAROLD J. MCELHINNY
4 MICHAEL A. JACOBS
5 RACHEL KREVANS
425 MARKET STREET
SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA 94105

6 FOR COUNTERCLAIMANT WILMER, CUTLER, PICKERING,
7 APPLE: HALE AND DORR
8 BY: WILLIAM F. LEE
60 STATE STREET
BOSTON, MASSACHUSETTS 02109

9 BY: MARK D. SELWYN
10 950 PAGE MILL ROAD
PALO ALTO, CALIFORNIA 94304

11 FOR THE DEFENDANT: QUINN, EMANUEL, URQUHART,
12 OLIVER & HEDGES
13 BY: CHARLES K. VERHOEVEN
50 CALIFORNIA STREET, 22ND FLOOR
SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA 94111

14 BY: VICTORIA F. MAROULIS
15 KEVIN P.B. JOHNSON
555 TWIN DOLPHIN DRIVE
16 SUITE 560
REDWOOD SHORES, CALIFORNIA 94065

17 BY: MICHAEL T. ZELLER
18 WILLIAM C. PRICE
865 SOUTH FIGUEROA STREET
19 10TH FLOOR
LOS ANGELES, CALIFORNIA 90017

20
21
22
23
24
25

INDEX OF WITNESSES

PLAINTIFF'S

BORIS TEKSLER

CROSS-EXAM BY MS. MAROULIS (RES.) P. 2006
REDIRECT EXAM BY MR. MUELLER P. 2009
RE-CROSS-EXAM BY MS. MAROULIS P. 2019
FURTHER REDIRECT EXAM P. 2022

JUN WON LEE

BY VIDEOTAPED DEPOSITION P. 2023
2025

DONG HOON CHANG

BY VIDEOTAPED DEPOSITION P. 2026

TIMOTHY BENNER

BY VIDEOTAPED DEPOSITION P. 2028
2029

TIMOTHY SHEPPARD

BY VIDEOTAPED DEPOSITION P. 2030

TERRY MUSIKA

DIRECT EXAM BY MS. KREVANS P. 2031
CROSS-EXAM BY MR. PRICE P. 2098
REDIRECT EXAM BY MS. KREVANS P. 2160
RE-CROSS-EXAM BY MR. PRICE P. 2165
FURTHER REDIRECT EXAM P. 2171

DEFENDANT'S

BENJAMIN BEDERSON

DIRECT EXAM BY MR. DEFRANCO P. 2228
CROSS-EXAM BY MR. JACOBS P. 2254
REDIRECT EXAM BY MR. DEFRANCO P. 2269

ADAM BOGUE

DIRECT EXAM BY MR. JOHNSON P. 2274
CROSS-EXAM BY MR. JACOBS P. 2300

INDEX OF EXHIBITSMARKEDADMITTEDPLAINTIFF'S

69 AND 89	2028
28	2057
34	2079
194	2082
25A-1	2094
2227	2273
41.1 AND 41.2	2273

DEFENDANT'S

572.003	2128
518	2235
3951.001 AND 3951.002	2235
3951.010	2239
546	2240
528	2245
518	2251
3951.007 AND 3951.009	2251
696	2277
695	2281
661	2287
3952.101	2287
662	2289
3952.102	2291
713	2298

JOINT

1500	2041
------	------

1 PROPERTY, SHOULD GO BACK TO APPLE, AND THAT'S WHY
2 THAT MONEY SLIDES BACK ACROSS.

3 Q OKAY. FOR PURPOSES OF FORMING YOUR OPINIONS
4 IN THIS CASE, HAVE YOU DONE ANYTHING TO EVALUATE
5 SAMSUNG'S ACCUSED SMARTPHONE SALES AND SAMSUNG'S
6 ACCUSED TABLET SALES?

7 A I HAVE.

8 Q OKAY. CAN WE SEE SLIDE 34B.6.

9 WHAT WAS YOUR OVERALL CONCLUSION ABOUT
10 THE VOLUME OF SAMSUNG'S ACCUSED SMARTPHONE AND
11 TABLET SALES AND THE REVENUES ASSOCIATED WITH THAT?

12 A WELL, THE DAMAGE NUMBERS I'VE JUST GIVEN YOU
13 ARE VERY LARGE, AND THEY'RE VERY LARGE BECAUSE
14 WE'RE DEALING WITH A VERY LARGE QUANTITY OF SALES.

15 WHAT'S DEPICTED HERE IS THAT THE
16 COMBINATION OF SMARTPHONES AND TABLETS, OVER THE
17 TWO YEARS THAT'S AT ISSUE IN THIS CASE, SAMSUNG HAS
18 SOLD 22.7 MILLION INDIVIDUAL SMARTPHONES AND/OR
19 TABLETS.

20 THE AMOUNT THAT'S ASSOCIATED WITH THOSE
21 SALES IS \$8,160,000,000. THAT'S SAMSUNG'S NUMBER.
22 THAT'S JUST -- THAT'S THAT MONEY THAT SLID ACROSS.
23 IT WAS EQUAL TO \$8,160,000,000.

24 Q WHERE DID YOU GET THE INFORMATION THAT YOU
25 USED TO DERIVE THE 22 MILLION INFRINGING SALES AND

1 THE \$8 BILLION OF REVENUE?

2 A THAT'S AN IMPORTANT POINT. THESE AREN'T MY
3 NUMBERS. THESE ARE SAMSUNG'S NUMBERS. THIS IS
4 ACTUALLY TAKEN DIRECTLY FROM SAMSUNG'S RECORDS.

5 Q OKAY. COULD WE LOOK AT JOINT EXHIBIT 1500,
6 PLEASE. JUST LOOK AT THAT IN YOUR BINDER FOR A
7 MOMENT, MR. MUSIKA.

8 DO YOU HAVE -- IT SHOULD BE RIGHT AT THE
9 FRONT.

10 A I'VE GOT IT.

11 Q OKAY. WHAT IS JOINT EXHIBIT 1500?

12 A JOINT EXHIBIT 1500 IS AN EXHIBIT THAT HAS BEEN
13 JOINTLY SUBMITTED BY BOTH APPLE AND SAMSUNG AND
14 AGREED TO BY BOTH PARTIES, AND IT LISTS THOSE TOTAL
15 8 BILLION OF SALES --

16 Q LET ME STOP YOU FOR A MOMENT BEFORE YOU TELL
17 US THE NUMBERS.

18 YOUR HONOR, WE WOULD MOVE THE ADMISSION
19 OF JOINT EXHIBIT 1500.

20 THE COURT: ANY OBJECTION?

21 MR. PRICE: NO OBJECTION.

22 THE COURT: OKAY. IT'S ADMITTED.

23 (WHEREUPON, JOINT EXHIBIT NUMBER 1500,
24 HAVING BEEN PREVIOUSLY MARKED FOR
25 IDENTIFICATION, WAS ADMITTED INTO

1 EVIDENCE.)

2 MS. KREVANS: COULD WE SHOW THE JURY,
3 MR. LEE, JOINT EXHIBIT 1500.

4 Q CAN YOU -- IN EXHIBIT 1500, CAN YOU SHOW US
5 WHERE YOU GOT THE 22 MILLION PHONE AND TABLET SALES
6 AND THE 8 BILLION REVENUE NUMBERS.

7 A RIGHT. I'D LIKE TO APOLOGIZE, FIRST, FOR THE
8 SMALL NUMBERS; AND SECONDLY, I'M GOING TO BE
9 ABBREVIATING A LOT OF NUMBERS FROM TIME TO TIME, SO
10 THAT COULD GET A LITTLE CONFUSING. I WANT TO MAKE
11 SURE THAT I TRY TO POINT OUT WHEN I'M SAYING 2.4
12 BILLION OR MILLION SO I DON'T CONFUSE THE COURT.

13 SO YOUR PENDING QUESTION, IF WE WOULD GO
14 DOWN TO THE -- IN MOST SCHEDULES, IT ADDS ACROSS.
15 THESE ARE CALENDAR QUARTERS, AND THEN THAT FINAL
16 COLUMN ON THE RIGHT TOTALS DOWN.

17 SO THIS IS THE PORTION OF THE SALES THAT
18 RELATE TO THE SMARTPHONES, AND IF WE GO TO THE
19 BOTTOM THERE, SO THIS IS -- THIS IS A TRUNCATED --
20 OR IT'S A NUMBER THAT'S CUT OFF, SO THAT 21 IS
21 21,251,000 SMARTPHONE UNITS, AND THE NUMBER BELOW
22 IT WITH THE DOLLAR SIGN IS 7,516,000,000.

23 AND TO GET BACK TO OUR 22 MILLION AND OUR
24 \$8 BILLION NUMBER, WE HAVE TO ADD PAGE 2, WHICH IS
25 THE TABLETS.



1 WE GO TO THE SAME SPOT, AND THERE'S THE
2 1,438 TABLETS, WE ADD THAT TO THE SMARTPHONE TO GET
3 TO THE \$22 MILLION -- OR 22 MILLION UNITS, AND
4 THERE'S 644,000, WHICH WE ADD THAT BACK TO THE
5 SMARTPHONES, WE GET TO THE \$8.1 BILLION.

6 Q NOW, MR. MUSIKA, YOU SAID 644,000, THAT NUMBER
7 THERE IS -- BECAUSE IT'S MISSING ZEROS, IT'S
8 ACTUALLY WHAT?

9 A MILLIONS. SORRY. I DID IT MYSELF. I
10 APOLOGIZE.

11 Q ALL RIGHT. DOES THIS REPRESENT SALES JUST IN
12 THE UNITED STATES?

13 A SALES OF TABLETS AND SMARTPHONES ONLY IN THE
14 UNITED STATES BY THE DEFENDANT SAMSUNG.

15 Q OKAY. HAVE YOU LOOKED AT INFORMATION ABOUT
16 HOW SAMSUNG'S SALES OF THE ACCUSED PRODUCTS IN THIS
17 CASE -- LET ME START OVER.

18 HAVE YOU LOOKED AT INFORMATION ABOUT HOW
19 SAMSUNG SALES OF SMARTPHONES AND TABLETS BEFORE THE
20 INTRODUCTION OF THE ACCUSED PRODUCTS IN THIS CASE
21 COMPARED TO SAMSUNG SALES OF SMARTPHONES AND
22 TABLETS AFTER THE INTRODUCTION OF THE ACCUSED
23 PRODUCTS?

24 A YES.

25 Q OKAY. COULD WE SEE SLIDE 34B.9. WHAT

1 INFORMATION IS SHOWN ON 34B.9, MR. MUSIKA?

2 A THIS IS A GRAPH, AND ON THE VERTICAL AXIS,
3 IT'S THE MARKET SHARE PERCENT. SO IT'S HOW MUCH OF
4 THE OVERALL SMARTPHONE MARKET DID SAMSUNG HAVE OVER
5 TIME, WHICH IS OUR HORIZONTAL X AXIS THERE.

6 AND THE SLIDE IS DIVIDED UP, AS YOU JUST
7 INDICATED, INTO TWO SEGMENTS. ON THE LEFT-HAND
8 SIDE WITH THE BLUE IS THE TIME PERIOD FOR SAMSUNG
9 PRIOR TO THE INTRODUCTION OF THEIR FIRST ACCUSED
10 PHONE, AND WHAT WE CAN SEE THEN WITH THE
11 INTRODUCTION OF THE FIRST ACCUSED PHONE, THE RED
12 LINE, ON THE RIGHT-HAND SIDE IS THE PERIOD OF TIME
13 AFTERWARDS.

14 Q AND HOW DO THE TWO PERIODS, THAT IS, BEFORE
15 AND AFTER, COMPARE TO ONE ANOTHER?

16 A YES. IT'S A RATHER DRAMATIC DEMONSTRATION OF
17 SAMSUNG WAS LOSING MARKET SHARE DURING THE PERIOD
18 PRIOR TO 2010, APPROXIMATELY JUNE OF 2010 WHEN THEY
19 INTRODUCED THE FIRST ACCUSED PHONE.

20 AFTER THEY INTRODUCED THE FIRST ACCUSED
21 PHONE, SAMSUNG'S MARKET SHARE TOOK AN ABRUPT UPWARD
22 SWING AND HAS CONTINUED TODAY TO ADVANCE
23 DRAMATICALLY IN INCREASES IN MARKET SHARE.

24 Q WHERE DID THE INFORMATION THAT FORMS THIS
25 CHART COME FROM?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CERTIFICATE OF REPORTER

I, THE UNDERSIGNED OFFICIAL COURT
REPORTER OF THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR
THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA, 280 SOUTH
FIRST STREET, SAN JOSE, CALIFORNIA, DO HEREBY
CERTIFY:

THAT THE FOREGOING TRANSCRIPT,
CERTIFICATE INCLUSIVE, CONSTITUTES A TRUE, FULL AND
CORRECT TRANSCRIPT OF MY SHORTHAND NOTES TAKEN AS
SUCH OFFICIAL COURT REPORTER OF THE PROCEEDINGS
HEREINBEFORE ENTITLED AND REDUCED BY COMPUTER-AIDED
TRANSCRIPTION TO THE BEST OF MY ABILITY.

/s/

LEE-ANNE SHORTRIDGE, CSR, CRR
CERTIFICATE NUMBER 9595

DATED: AUGUST 14, 2012