

1 HAROLD J. MCELHINNY (CA SBN 66781)  
hmcclhinny@mofo.com  
2 MORRISON & FOERSTER LLP  
425 Market Street  
3 San Francisco, California 94105-2482  
Telephone: (415) 268-7000  
4 Facsimile: (415) 268-7522

CHARLES K. VERHOEVEN (CB SBN  
170151)  
charlesverhoeven@quinnemanuel.com  
QUINN EMANUEL URQUHART &  
SULLIVAN, PP  
50 California Street, 22<sup>nd</sup> Floor  
San Francisco, California 94111

5 Attorneys for Plaintiff

Attorneys for Defendants

6 APPLE INC.

SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO., LTD.,  
SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS AMERICA,  
7 INC., AND SAMSUNG  
8 TELECOMMUNICATIONS AMERICA,  
LLC

9 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
10 NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
11 SAN JOSE DIVISION

12 APPLE INC., a California corporation,

Case No. 11-cv-01846-LHK

13 Plaintiff,

14 v.

15 SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO., LTD., a  
16 Korean corporation; SAMSUNG  
ELECTRONICS AMERICA, INC., a New York  
17 corporation; and SAMSUNG  
TELECOMMUNICATIONS AMERICA, LLC, a  
18 Delaware limited liability company,

**JOINT STATEMENT ON PERSON  
OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE  
ART AND REPORT REGARDING  
MEET AND CONFER ON  
DISPUTED CLAIM TERMS**

19 Defendants.  
20

21 In accordance with the Court's request on January 17, 2012, the parties have conferred on  
22 the proposed person of ordinary skill in the art for each of the patents at issue in the *Markman*  
23 hearing, but have been unable to reach agreement on all of the definitions. The parties have  
24 agreed on the definition with respect to the '002 patent, and have set forth their proposals in Table  
25 1 below. The parties will continue to meet and confer prior to the hearing in order to attempt to  
26 reach agreement on some of the proposals, and to reduce the scope of their disagreements on the  
27 remainder.  
28



**TABLE 1**

<b>Patent</b>	<b>Apple's Proposals</b>	<b>Samsung's Proposals</b>
'002 Patent	A person of ordinary skill in the relevant art of the '002 patent at the time of the invention would have a Bachelor's degree in computer science (or equivalent industry experience), and at least two years of experience in the area of computer programming and/or operating systems.	A person of ordinary skill in the art would have a Bachelor's Degree in computer science (or equivalent industry experience) and at least two years of experience in the area of computer programming and/or operating systems.
'891 Patent	A person of ordinary skill in the relevant art of the '891 patent at the time of the invention would have a Bachelor's degree in computer science or electrical engineering or an equivalent, and one or more years experience working on designing and/or implementing user interfaces.	A person of ordinary skill in the art would have a Bachelor's Degree in computer science (or equivalent industry experience) and at least two years of experience in the area of computer programming and/or operating systems.
'381 Patent	A person of ordinary skill in the relevant art of the '381 patent at the time of the invention would have a Bachelor's degree in computer science or electrical engineering or an equivalent, and one or more years experience working on designing and/or implementing user interfaces.	A person of ordinary skill in the art would have a Bachelor's Degree in computer science, and 3-5 years of software design and implementation experience, including experience with graphical user interface design, or would have equivalent educational and work experience.

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	'915 Patent  A person of ordinary skill in the relevant art of the '915 patent at the time of the invention would have a Bachelor's degree in computer science or electrical engineering or an equivalent, and one or more years experience working with electronic devices with touch screen displays.	A person of ordinary skill in the art would have a Bachelor's Degree in computer science (or equivalent industry experience) and at least two years of experience in the area of computer programming and/or operating systems.
10 11 12 13 14 15 16	'607 Patent  A person of ordinary skill in the relevant art of the '607 patent at the time of the invention would have a Bachelor's degree in electrical engineering, physics, computer engineering, or an equivalent, and two or more years experience working with input devices.	A person of ordinary skill in the art would have a Bachelor's Degree in electrical engineering, physics, computer engineering, or a related field and 2-3 years of work experience with input devices.
17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28	'828 Patent:  A person of ordinary skill in the relevant art of the '828 patent at the time of the invention would have a Bachelor's degree in computer science, electrical engineering, physics, mathematics, or an equivalent, and several years experience working in the area of signal processing, human-computer interaction, or the design, use, or evaluation of touch-sensitive input devices.	A person of ordinary skill in the art would have a Bachelor's Degree in computer science, electrical engineering or Mathematics and several years of experience in the area of signal processing, human-computer interaction or the design, use, and/or evaluation of touch-sensitive input devices.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

'711 Patent	For the '711 patent, a person of ordinary skill in the art in 2005 would have at least a bachelor's degree in computer science/engineering or similar discipline and several years' relevant industry or academic research experience in the areas of multitasking systems, embedded systems or programming for handheld devices. Alternatively, the ordinary artisan would have had a more advanced degree in computer science/engineering or a similar field with somewhat less additional work or research experience.	A person of ordinary skill in the art would have a Bachelor's Degree in computer science/engineering and several years of experience in multitasking systems and computer programming, or a Master's Degree with less relevant experience, or a person with equivalent industry experience.
-------------	---	---

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**ECF ATTESTATION**

I, MICHAEL A. JACOBS, am the ECF User whose ID and password are being used to file the following document: JOINT STATEMENT ON PERSON OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART AND REPORT REGARDING MEET AND CONFER ON DISPUTED CLAIM TERMS. In compliance with General Order 45, X.B., I hereby attest that Todd Briggs has concurred in this filing.

Dated: January 19, 2012

**MICHAEL A. JACOBS**  
**MORRISON & FOERSTER LLP**

By: /s/ Michael Jacobs  
MICHAEL A. JACOBS